

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT



Planning and Zoning
Division
Department of Community
and Economic Development

AMENDMENTS TO CHAPTER 21A.46.120 Proposal to Create a Localized Alternative Sign Overlay for Library Square Case #PLNPCM2011-00451 25 April 2012

Applicant

Mayor Ralph Becker

Staff

John Anderson
john.anderson@slcgov.com
(801) 535-7214

Applicable Zone

PL-2 Public Lands

Master Plan Designation

Institutional

Council District

District 4, Luke Garrott

Lot Size

10 acres

Current Use

Public facilities and limited
commercial

Applicable Land Use Regulations

Title 21A -- Zoning
21A.46.120 Sign Regulations for
Special Purpose Districts
21A.46.130 Localized Alternative Sign
Overlay Districts

Notice

- Notice mailed on 12 April 2012
- Published in the Newspaper 12
April 2012
- Posted on City & State Websites 12
April 2012

Attachments

- A. Public Comments
- B. Existing PL-2 Sign Standards
- C. Proposed Localized Alternative
Sign Overlay District Standards
- D. Petition Request

REQUEST

On August 2, 2011, Mayor Ralph Becker initiated a petition requesting amendments to the Salt Lake City Code that would create a Localized Alternative Sign Overlay District for the Library Square area. This request has been made to help create more options for signage to advertise the small retail businesses located within the City Library and for the newly opened museum, The Leonardo.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission review the proposed modifications to the Salt Lake City Code to create a Localized Alternative Sign Overlay District for the Library Square area, and forward a positive recommendation to the City Council for a zoning text amendment that would allow for its creation.

POTENTIAL MOTIONS

Positive Recommendation: Based on the findings listed in the staff report and testimony given, I move that the Planning Commission forward a favorable recommendation for petition PLNPCM2011-00451 to the City Council

-OR-

Negative Recommendation: I move that the Planning Commission forward a negative recommendation for petition PLNPCM2011-00451 to the City Council based on the following findings (Commissioner then states the findings):

Background

The Public Lands District does not have a great allowance for exterior signage. This is not surprising as most areas located in the PL-2 District are public facilities and do not contain commercial uses. At Library Square, it has been expressed by the small businesses located within the library that they have been unable to sufficiently advertise for themselves. The library has also discussed its need to temporarily advertise before and during special annual events that occur on Library Square such as the Utah Arts Festival.

With the recent opening of The Leonardo at Library Square the need for signage on the block has increased and changed. The facility has a need for permanent signage to direct guests in and around their facilities as well as advertising for special events and temporary exhibits at the museum. These temporary types of sign currently are generally prohibited by the Zoning Ordinance.

The Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance allows for the creation of localized alternative sign overlay districts in 21A.46.130. The approval of a localized alternative sign overlay district for a specified area in the city creates a new section of the sign ordinance that gives specific rules and regulations for signage. The signage regulations required by the underlying zoning district would be applicable to the specific area outlined as the overlay district. Three of these districts have already been created in Salt Lake City. They are located at Energy Solutions Arena, Spring Mobile Ballpark and the automobile dealerships located at 1530 South 500 West.

Public Participation

This application was reviewed at the Public Open House on November 17, 2011. There were no comments submitted during the open house. Staff has received a limited number of written comments which can be found in Attachment A.

Issue Analysis

If adopted, a Localized Alternative Sign Overlay will be created, and the sign standards and limitations at Library Square will be governed by a new section added to the zoning ordinance. Below is a summary of the section proposed to be added to the ordinance along with analysis and rationale for the amendments:

Affected Code Sections

Title 21A.46.120 Sign Regulations for Special Purpose Districts

Qualifying Provisions

The existing limited signage regulations for the PL-2 Public Lands District can be found in Attachment B. The proposed addition to the section which would create a localized alternative sign overlay and the signage regulations within Library Square can be found in Attachment C.

Analysis

A localized alternative sign overlay has been created three times in the past in Salt Lake City utilizing 21A.46.130 of the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance which discusses the overlay district creation requirements. It states as a purpose, *that it only be allowed for large scaled land uses, a special purpose district or large institutions- having common design elements that can be complemented and enhanced through the use of special signage.* Library Square is located in the PL-2 District which is a special purpose district and does act as a multi-building campus.

Further in 21A.46.130.B it states that a localized alternative sign overlay can only be located on parcels that are more than two acres and located in one of the listed zoning districts. The PL-2 District is listed as an allowed zoning district. Library Square is unique in that limited appropriate commercial uses have been intertwined with the expected civic uses. By allowing for an increase in the amount of signage, staff believes that these small businesses will increase their ability to be successful by adding a level of visibility.

The area is also home to many special events throughout the year. Currently, most types of temporary signage is prohibited by the zoning ordinance or approved through a cumbersome permitting process. The proposed amendments would outline standards for the use of temporary signage and would differentiate between the library and The Leonardo, as to the amount of temporary signage that would be allowed on and around the facilities. This would apply to special events and festivals as well as to temporary exhibits or other activities happening at Library Square.

The unique architecture of the two buildings has a dramatic effect on the use and placement of signage at Library Square. The general curvature of the structure paired with the large amount of glass on the library does not allow for the placement of a large amount of signage. The Leonardo, has been asked by Salt Lake City Building Services, not to attach signage to the large concrete panels that make up approximately 60% of the outside of the building. The unique characteristics of the architecture as well as the unique needs help to further demonstrate how a localized alternative sign overlay district can help to enhance the area and complement one another through the use of special signage.

The proposal combined signage requirements from nearby and adjacent zoning districts such as the D-1 Central Business District. For example, the amount of flat signage, awning/canopy signs or window signs proposed to be allowed on Library Square are the same as allowed in the D-1 zoning district. Several types of signs that are allowed in the D-1 zoning district would not be permitted to help retain the civic nature of the block.

Because the buildings lack a great deal of wall space that can be utilized to hang signage, the proposed overlay district would allow for the placement of monument signs on the property around the buildings and they would be limited to ten feet in height. No pole signs would be allowed. The only other additional signage proposed, would be the allowance for signage on the light poles located in the plaza between the library and The Leonardo.

Staff believes that the most significant change proposed is the allowance of temporary or special event signage on the buildings at Library Square. In the past, this is something that has been generally prohibited throughout the city but has commonly occurred. Staff believes that it is vital to success of the uses on Library Square to have the ability to advertise for special exhibits and other temporary events

but must ensure that temporary signage is allowed for a limited amount of time. The amount of temporary signage proposed to be allowed is controlled by the use. The proposed language would allow special event signage to cover a maximum of sixty percent of the exterior of a museum and twenty-five percent of the exterior of a library. The different standards are proposed because the library is limited by its architecture and that according to their staff do not have a need to cover more of the building with special event signage.

STANDARDS FOR GENERAL AMENDMENTS

A decision to amend the text of the Zoning Ordinance or the Zoning Map by general amendment is a matter committed to the legislative discretion of the City Council and is not controlled by any one standard. However, in making its decision concerning a proposed amendment, the City Council should consider the following factors:

1. Whether a proposed text amendment is consistent with the purposes, goals, objectives, and policies of the City as stated through its various adopted planning documents;

Discussion: The Central Community Master Plan briefly discusses Library Square specifically in two sections in the Institutional section and also in the Open Space section.

Staff believes that there are two policies in the Institutional section of the master plan that relate to this specific proposal. First, it is listed as Institutional land use policy, INSLU2.1, *“Encourage existing cultural and entertainment facilities and organizations to remain in the Central Community...”* Later in policy INSLU2.2 it states, *“Promote the use of parks and plazas for cultural events and ensure that the size of the event does not exceed the facility’s capacity.”*

The Open Space section also discusses Library Square in two places. It is mentioned that the square is an, *“opportunity to develop parks, open space and recreational land uses”* and that could be accomplished by, *“Expanding open space and recreation areas with development of Library Square.”* Later it states as a goal, *“Designing and implementing the 450 South Corridor from 200 East to 700 East to provide open space opportunities linked to Library Square and Washington Square open space areas.”*

As proposed the amendments would have little effect on the land uses on Library Square and would not be harmful to the policies and goals stated above. The amendments will not diminish the ability of Library Square to act as a cultural, entertainment and open space resource. In fact, staff believes that it may enhance its ability to draw people to utilize the facilities at Library Square whether as visitors to the specific commercial or civic uses. Staff does not believe that the proposed amendments of the Zoning Ordinance will be in conflict with either section of the Central Community Master Plans.

Finding: The proposed text change is consistent with the adopted master plans or other adopted planning documents.

2. Whether a proposed text amendment furthers the specific purpose statements of the zoning ordinance.

Analysis: The purpose of the PL-2 public lands district as listed in the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance, is to *specifically delineate areas of public use and to control the potential redevelopment of public uses, lands and facilities in an urban context. This district is appropriate in areas of the city where the applicable master plans support this type of land use.*

Staff finds that the proposed changes to the Zoning Ordinance will have no negative effects on the overall purpose of the Zoning Ordinance and in the specific purpose statements for the PL-2 Public Lands District. Further staff finds that the proposed amendments will have a positive effect in that it will help draw more people to utilize public lands in the city.

Finding: The proposed text amendment meets this standard.

3. Whether a proposed text amendment is consistent with the purposes and provisions of any applicable overlay zoning districts which may impose additional standards.

Discussion: The proposed text amendment would create a specific overlay zoning district but currently there are no existing overlay districts that would be impacted by this proposed amendment.

Finding: The proposed text amendment meets this standard.

4. The extent to which a proposed text amendment implements best current, professional practices of urban planning and design.

Discussion: Staff recognizes that commercial land uses have a need for advertisement of products or services. Staff also recognizes the civic uses located on Library Square and the need to allow for further advertisement without spoiling the unique architecture and landscaping on the square. The standards as proposed should allow the existing land uses on the block to advertise their services fully and more creatively by not being bound to limited regulations.

Finding: The proposed text amendment meets this standard

Attachment A
Public Comments

Anderson, John

From: Lyndon Tan [tanlyndon@gmail.com]
Sent: Thursday, November 17, 2011 11:33 AM
To: Anderson, John; Ximena Tan
Subject: Signage at Library Square

Hi John! Can you please pass this letter along to Mayor Becker regarding library signage? Thank you so much.

Dear Mayor Becker,

My wife and I own The English Garden Flower Shop inside the Main Library. We have been in business since the Library opened. We are grateful to be a part of the Library community shops and we hope our presence at the Library is mutually beneficial for our business and the library.

For the almost ten years that we have been part of the Library, customers who are trying to find us usually end up calling us to ask where we are located because they do not realize there are shops inside the Library. Who knows how many never bothered to call for various reasons. A signage outside the Library telling people who the tenants are inside the Library is very important for our survival. How can our business survive if people do not know we exist? Our business only exist to those library patrons and others who are familiar with the library. Any smart business person would have thrown the towel many years ago. How many tenants has left the library since it opened? The English Garden is only one of the three original tenants trying to survive.

As we developed long-term relationships with our customers and library patrons, one of the biggest complaints we have heard from them is that the Library is "scary." They usually say "I do not want to bring my family here." Since opening, our customer base has dwindled. It is partly because of the economy, but we mostly feel that the Library is no longer deemed as a family friendly place to be. We understand the library is for everybody. How could that be possibly true if the majority of the tax paying citizens do not want to come and use it because of its image as unsafe and un-family-friendly. We are most concerned about the drug dealing that is going on inside. We see drug transactions going on in the urban room in front of the stores and "monkey-business" takes place in the restrooms all the time. The library needs to set rules so it can be a library for "all" and not become a haven for the drug-dealers and other seedy elements. If people are caught doing criminal acts, they need to be penalized. If the homeless people wants to use the library, they need to follow rules like everybody else.

In order to survive, we have done lots of advertising to draw new customers, but many are frustrated when they cannot find us. People do not think there are stores inside the library. **The concept of businesses inside the library is foreign to many.** We are not asking for a neon-lit, gawdy sign to be put up outside. We are asking for a sign that is clearly visible to the public outside so they know we exist. We hope that it is not too much to ask after ten years.

Thank you so much for listening to our plea!

Sincerely,
Lyndon and Ximena Tan
The English Garden Flower Shop
Library Square, 210 East 400 South
801.364.6202

Attachment B

Existing PL-2 Public Lands District Sign Standards

4. Sign Type, Size And Height Standards For The PL, PL-2 And I Districts:

a. Standards For The PL, PL-2 And I Districts:

Types Of Signs Permitted	Maximum Area Per Sign Face	Maximum Height Of Freestanding Signs ¹	Minimum Setback ²	Number Of Signs Permitted
Construction sign	32 square feet	8 feet	10 feet	1 per street frontage
Development entry sign	40 square feet per sign	8 feet	10 feet	1 per street frontage
Flat sign	0.5 square foot per linear foot of building frontage	See note 1	n/a	1 for each frontage of each use
Monument sign	60 square feet	8 feet	10 feet	1 per building frontage
Nameplates	2 square feet	See note 1	n/a	1 per building entry
New development sign	160 square feet maximum per sign; 200 square feet for 2 signs	8 feet	10 feet	1 per street frontage
Political sign	16 square feet	8 feet	10 feet	No limit
Private directional sign	8 square feet	4 feet	5 feet	No limit
Public safety sign	8 square feet	6 feet	10 feet	No limit
Real estate sign	32 square feet	8 feet	10 feet	1 per street frontage
Window sign	12 square feet	See note 1	n/a	No limit

Notes:

1.For height limits on building signs, see subsection [21A.46.070J](#) of this chapter.

2.Not applicable to temporary signs mounted as flat signs.

Attachment C
Proposed Localized Alternative Sign Overlay District Standards

c. Library Square Located On The Block Between 400 South And 500 South Between 200 East And 300 East Streets:

STANDARDS FOR LIBRARY SQUARE LOCATED ON THE
BLOCK BETWEEN 400 AND 500 SOUTH
BETWEEN 200 AND 300 EAST STREETS

Types Of Signs Permitted	Maximum Area Per Sign Face	Maximum Height Of Freestanding Signs¹	Minimum Setback²	Number Of Signs Permitted Per Sign Type	Limit On Combined Number Of Signs³
Awning/canopy signs	1 square foot per linear foot of storefront (sign area only)	See note 1	May extend 6 feet from face of building but not within 2 feet from back of curb ⁶	1 per first floor door/window	None
Construction sign	64 square feet	12 feet	5 feet	1 per storefront	None
Flat sign (general building orientation)	4 square feet per linear foot of building face ⁵	See note 1	n/a	1 per building face	None
Flat sign (storefront orientation) ⁴	2 square feet per linear foot of each store frontage ⁵	See note 1	n/a	1 per business storefront	None
Special Event Sign ⁸	Sign may cover up to 60% of the total building face. ⁹	See note 1	n/a	1 per street frontage	None
Special Event Light Pole Signs	See footnote ¹⁰	May not exceed the height of the light pole	n/a	2 per light pole	None
Monument sign	1 square foot per linear foot of street frontage	20 feet	None	1 per street frontage	1 sign per street frontage
Nameplate, building	3 square feet	8 square feet	None	1 per building	
New development sign	200 square feet	12 feet	5 feet	1 per street frontage	None
Political sign	32 square feet	8 feet	5 feet	No limit	None
Private	8 square feet	4 feet	5 feet	No limit	None

directional sign					
Public safety sign	8 square feet	6 square feet	None	No limit	None
Real estate sign	32 square feet	8 feet	None	1 per street frontage	None
Window signs	25% of total frontage window area per use	No limit	n/a	No limit	None

Notes:

1. For height limits on building signs, see subsection [21A.46.070J](#) of this chapter.
2. Not applicable to temporary signs mounted as flat signs.
3. The total number of signs permitted from the sign types combined.
4. Storefront flat signs limited to locations on the lower 2 floors.
5. A single-tenant building may combine the square footage total of the storefront orientation, digital wall projection and the general building orientation flat signs to construct 1 larger sign.
6. Public property lease and insurance required for projection over property line.
7. Verbiage and/or corporate logos are limited to on premises advertising of events only and are limited to 10 percent of the window coverage.
8. Amount only allowed on buildings where the majority of the building houses a public museum. For those buildings where the majority of the building is utilized as a library only 25 % (twenty-five percent) of the building may be covered with this type of signage.
9. Special event signs may hang during the entirety of a special event and may be installed three weeks prior to the event. Special event signage shall not be on the building for more than 90 days out of each calendar year.
10. Special event light pole signs must not act as a barrier to pedestrian movement and must advertise for events on premises. They shall not extend more than 18 (eighteen) inches from the light pole and shall not extend higher than the light poles.

Attachment D
Petition Request



Petition Initiation Request

Planning Division

Community & Economic Development
Department

To: Mayor Becker

From: Wilf Sommerkorn, Planning Director *WS*

Date: August 2, 2011

CC: David Everitt, Chief of Staff; Frank Gray, Community and Economic Development Director; Mary De La Mare-Schaefer, Community & Economic Development Department Deputy Director; Cheri Coffey, Assistant Planning Director; file

Re: Analyze the appropriateness of amending the City Code and Zoning Ordinance relating to the creation of a Localized Alternative Sign Overlay District for Library Square located within a PL-2 Public Lands District.

This memo is to request that you initiate a petition directing the Planning Division to analyze the appropriateness of amending the City Code and Zoning Ordinance relating to the creation of a Localized Alternative Sign Overlay, as per Section 21A.46.130 of the Salt Lake City Code. The analysis would be to determine whether the City should allow for the creation of special sign regulations to meet the signage needs of Library Square including signage for the businesses, exhibits, special events, etc. as well as similar signage needs of the Leonardo Science Center. This block is located within a PL-2 Public Lands District.

It has been expressed from the small businesses located within these blocks and from members of the administration that they have struggled to attract customers. Based upon their interior location and no allowance for exterior signage many potential patrons do not know that these shops/café's are open for business. With the Leonardo Science Center opening there will be a

need for permanent, special event and exhibit signage. Currently special event and exhibit signage are not allowed or require temporary approvals. These processes may not be timely and lack clear guidance to specific provisions for signage.

As part of the process, the Planning Division will follow the City adoption process for amending the City Code and Zoning Ordinance which includes citizen input and public hearings with the Planning Commission and City Council.

If you have any questions, please contact me.

Thank you.

Concurrence to initiate the zoning text amendment petition as noted above.



Ralph Becker, Mayor



Date